A conceptual study on Innovative Motivation Model to Industrial Private Security force

V. Rangarajan[1], Tamil Jyothi[2]

[1]Research Scholar in Bharthiyar University, Coimbatore, Tamil Nadu, & Assistant Professor, Sri Malolan college of Arts and Sciences , Mathuranthagam, Chenglepattu District. Tamil Nadu, sdbranga@yahoo.co.uk
[2]Associate Professor, MBA Department , Annamalai, University, Chidambaram. Tamil Nadu

Abstract

In recent times the need and demand for security services have grown dramatically in the wake of security threats in all sectors irrespective of the nature of the business and size. The limitation of government is that it is neither their constitutional duty nor has the adequate resources to protect the private sector at all times. Given the limitations ,many private sector players in Private Security Industry took the initiative to secure their properties by training, deploying the civilians to guard the commercial establishments. As a next step the organizations need to motivate the untrained, unskilled or semi skilled to suit to the job description. The onus is on the HR and Administration manager, executives who are directly responsible for security of the properties and people in their business locations. On the other hand the challenges faced by HR department as how to motivate the security workforce cutting cross all states to run the business and to secure the properties

Interestingly the Private security Industry's   turn over is pegged around Rs.20,000 crores with employment to 70 lakhs of people by 2020. Undoubtedly the volume is growing exponentially. .

Introduction

Motivation as a subject is highly evolving and fascinating one --keeping the innovation in mind – the innovation and growing needs of human kind. Motivation is highly intertwined in various elements of human kind starting from birth to death. Every living being is constantly progressing at every stage but closely associated with inexplicable human mind, heart, actions.   The humans utilize   only negligible 3% of the brain. The advancement   in every field by human capacity is the ample evidence of power of mind. Therefore it is correct to state the behind every progress there is a need or desire or want. Years of progressive research proved that mind and body are motivated by several psychological factors, which are interestingly interconnected to the external factors on which mind has no or little control. Human mind and motivation are certainly directly proportionate to the intentions and desires of the person. If the intention to perform is present and desire to actually perform is absent, the outcome is negative.   For instance the desire is to perform well in the exams by the students, results into the good job. A good job, salary, status, family such other factors are considered as motivational factors.   Motivation results into the action, response, inaction. Motivation in simple words is an influence in the human   mind by powerful means. Innovation is definitely needed in motivating the security personnel for the mere fact

that the security personnel is the least level of employees an organization considers.

Review of Literature

Jeffery. Sheppard. & Jesse O. Mintz-Roth Policy (2005) The researchers had studied the security performance of Private Security Personnel by interview method wherein they had interviewed about 100 private security officers in 39 A class 46 commercial findings. After analyzing the response of the respondents they found many observations. These include that Standards of security officers are far below the standards, Security officers' wages are low, health care benefits are unaffordable or not offered, most officers had lesser training than New York State stipulates.

International Journal of Management Sciences, ISSN 0973-2101 Vol. 7, No.1, July 2011. In the Article titled as Plight and Predicament of Security Guards Engaged by Private Security Agencies in India. Dr. Sanjay Upadhyaya, Fellow V.V. Giri National Labour Institute, Noida had ellborately discussed about the study he conducted in Delhi in NCR region with 40 security agencies wherein about 200 security guards were interviewed. The study made a detailed study on the working conditions, wages paid to security personnel, training, motivation amongst the security operations. His recommendation include better training, better wages, better working conditions, various welfare measures and benefits to the security personnel. No doubt all these factors are favourable to motivate the security personnel to continue to put in the best performance. Besides, the outcome of such performance is pro active steps on the incidents of pilferage, thefts, information theft, connivance, fraud, white collar crime. The motivation drives the workforce to act ears and eyes of the management especially to HR and Admn wings of the organization. He further recommends various incentives, non financial

welfare measures, reduced working hours, more number of uniform dress etc. All these factors collectively shape a ordinary working employee to highly motivated workforce over a period of time.

Author: Jeffrey Zisner, CPP and owner of AEGIS, a Los Angeles Security & Investigations firm in the article "Employee Motivation and Retention in Private security Industry" brought out several factors that describe the characteristics of unmotivated security service workforce. Angry, disenchanted, and unmotivated employees only cause problems for a security firm. At one point or another, nearly every field supervisor, operations manager, or company owner has gotten a call from their client saying, "I was wondering when the security is going to show up." He further added that recently, a security firm in San Diego, California had such a colossal problem with unmotivated staff showing up late or not showing up at all for work that they were forced to send a field supervisor to pick up guards at their homes and drive them to work. Furthermore, the report mentioned that ethical issues also arise once the employees get to work. In the past, guards have been caught stealing client and/or vandalizing company property, sleeping during a shift.

Jeffrey Zisner (2011) has researched about the private security industry since deadliest terrorist attack in what is called as 9/11 in World Trade Centre, USA. The attack has woken up the protection; professional both public and private enterprises Amongst many observations, low rate of wages to unarmed normal security guard occupies top most and primary factor for low performance of security guard. This means these are not fully trained guards as the trained ones do not come to such low remuneration to the clients. Some of the recommendations put forth by them are, companies need to only offer a trained and professional staff to their clients. Providing low tier, low paid staff drags down the industry,

companies need to conduct payroll accurately and as scheduled, companies need to provide as much information as they can about every job. Security people hate surprises, company management need to make their employees feel appreciated which may include awards for good service, continuing occupational training, and varying of assignments and companies need to be realistic in their promises. The study had summarized that the security guards can be motivated by many conventional and contemporary means in order to bring out the optimum level of performance from them.

Bhupinder Singh Bhullar (2015) traced the Private security Industry in India and examined the various factors including the growth and reasons for the same. They have made several recommendations including the training area which demands serious consideration in order to sustain the growth and provide consistent service in tune with the needs, demands of the business in various industries. As 95% of present security is manpower intensive, it is necessary for the various stake holders to invest in training the workforce to protect the people and properties which is the core and primary function of Private security service in any industry. The investment into training will definitely pay rich dividend in the long run. Therefore it is right to infer that the training serves a motivational factor to enhance the knowledge of security personnel -- in a non financial means – to perform

NSDC-KPMG Report (2018) The report traces the history of Private security service since a decade across India. It observed that any individual between the age of 18 to 65 can join in the private security service. It turned out to be that these persons have by and large failed in the gainful occupations and/ or rejected in other job markets. This raises the question whether the fitment either at the age of 18 or later at 60s in the employment is possible given the harsh nature of the job or

occupation in the security service in different business conditions. The total numbers of registered security agencies is 4347 with highest number 700 in Tamil Nadu alone. This indicates the industrial development, demand in the locations and skill gap in the state.. The inherent negative factors in security job include social stigma, absence of social welfare measures otherwise available in the other industries, distressed migration from different states in the demand driven states, high attrition rates due to stressful job nature. From this report it can be inferred that amongst the various performance gaps of security personnel , skill gap is the most critical one. To remove the social stigma from the job a security guard performs, he or she has to be adequately and consistently motivated through several means. One of the glaring motivational factors is the training to security personnel and the training enables the personnel to be " job fit"

Research Gap:

The researcher, during the review of literature studied several articles, reports, journals, publications, magazines, books and websites concerning to the security industry since 2005. It is observed that the scholastic or research journey has been limited or very little from the Indian scenario. There are few publications or reports on broader terms mostly dealing with the profile of the industry and the Govt initiatives through laws etc. A report in 2011 by Dr. Sanjay Upadhiyaya – Fellow-- V.V. Giri NationalLabour Institute, Delhi, is considered as a first   comprehensive contemporary study of Security service. The report dealt with the overall scenario highlighting the plight of the security service with reference to Noida near Delhi. Other literature consists of reports from FICCI, KPMG, NSDC travelled through the history, current status and road ahead in Security service. It is found that this industry is labour driven and labour intensive in nature . Yet

the critical aspect of Motivation of security work force has not caught of attention of scholars. Therefore evidently there is near absence of research or academic pursuit in the field motivation on conventional approach or through innovative approach in the security service industry employing 90 lakhs of workforce across different locations and industries.   More critically viewed, the industry itself is struggling to cope with demand and supply challenges in recent years. There is a scant attention paid to the innovation, motivation of these security personnel as a matter of recruitment and retention by HR department in the organisations.

Hence the researcher , by virtue of experience and constant interaction with all sorts of individuals involved in this industry, identified this research gap and took in the academic pursuit.

Research Methodology:

Research Methodology is a systematic process or procedure which is employed to conduct a research to serve or accomplish the objectives. It comprises of the identifying the population of Research and arriving at a desired sample of the study. Also it stipulates the principles for data collection and methods of data collection in various forms. After the proper method or tool is selected, the interviewer carries out the field work to collect the information. Once the desired sample is collected it has to be properly analysed as per the statistical tools .

The sample for this study is 50 and the population is 1000 which comprised different segments identified in the study.

The interviewer employed the formal interview method to collect the information as per the objectives. The data collected is so diverse or heterogeneous that specific tools to analyse the

response cannot be deployed. Further the response is more on statements rather than quantitative ones. The researcher has extensively interviewed the following people as the respondents. They are directly or indirectly involved in running the day to day operations of security service in various industries.

1. HR and Administrative Managers employed in manufacturing, IT, Banking and small organisations.
2. Chief Security officers in Private sectors.
3. Security officers in Bank and private establishments.
4. Vigilence officers in Bank on contract basis.
5. Security operations Managers.
6. Managing Directors of Security service organisations.
7. Marketing Managers.
8. Security guards working in different establishments.
9. Retired Defense officers in the rank of captain or above.
10. State Police Officers.
11. End users of security service.

The interview or unstructured discussion with above groups has centered around the innovation in managing, motivating , controlling   security personnel from their perspective. The innovative methods are expected to induce or influence the security personnel to produce the results close to desired ones.   Some of above are handling more than 1000   security workforce regularly.

The size of the respondents is 50 all put together in the above groups.

Objectives of the study

1. To Understand the Private Security Service industry and the factors involved in the performance of the security function by the

workforce.

2. To understand the needs to motivate the personnel and methods to motivate them
3. To study the outcome of motivation

Analysis and Discussion

Brief history of Security Service sector

India has the lowest police to population ratio resting at 0.95 : 1000 while global average stands at 3: 1000, while Hong Kong stands at 4.8 : 1000. The state police is no match N to face and counter the security threats and challenges of business for want of troops. The ground to produce the private security in protecting the business security threats is clearly seen and this has enhanced the role of private security sector. The PSS is in the present form is un organized, not optimally motivated or trained and equipped to confront the present and forthcoming challenges. Out of 200 million students enroll for school I of which only 20 million are able to finish Class XII signifying the dropout rate of 90% who do not have the necessary education or skills to be gainfully employed in the industries. This is the pool that PSS has to tap the potential employable manpower.

Profile of security personnel

The physical security is dominated by and related to physical fitness of the individuals who perform the security duties. Therefore it is important that security personnel do possess minimum basic qualification on body height, weight, eyesight, not physically challenged, hearing ability, sense of smelling . These are required ordinarily to lead a normal life for any individual with or without any income generating activity. But these factors play a major and critical to carry out the security duties such as walking, running, climbing, looking, watching, hearing, observing, writing, lifting etc in any activity to protect the properties and lives. But definitely and more so in business situations. Simply physical fitness is the face of the security personnel subject to other positive motivating factors.

Therefore without any doubt the profile of a security comprises of 1. Physical ability 2 Mental ability. These are the two sides of same coin. However mental ability also makes a security person more qualified to carry out the security function on regular basis without much of problems. Those who are responsible for recruiting and retaining should constantly look for innovative methods to do this.

Further, following are some of the qualities expected out of security personnel:

a. First and the foremost is disciplined approach in security duties
b. Uniformity that leads to consistency in approach.
c. Obedience which leads to reliability
d. Orderliness to organize the day to day affairs
e. Observation for pro active and post active measures

These attributes certainly contribute to the effective and efficient functioning of the duties in day to day routine in security department.

Current Scenario of Security service

In India the Private Security Service (PSS) is 300 million dollar industry, employs 7 million work force with annual growth rate is poised to be around 25%. While this is positive signal there is a 30% shortfall or gap between demand and supply of manpower. The workforce is manned by the economically weaker section of the society and majority of them are school drop outs on various

grounds. It is ironical that the image of security work force or perception of the general public is poor due to low wage and the profile of the work one has to perform. This industry is expected to offer employment opportunities across nation to the tune of 17 lakhs. It is governed and regulated by PSARA (Private Security Industries Association and Regulation Act) passed in 2005 and many states are not willing to adopt the regulations in true spirit due to various practical reasons. Private security service is State subject and implementation is solely dependent on the State Government . In order to give push to the industry Government of India had formed Security knowledge and Skill Development Council consisting of representatives of leading private security agencies, NSDC, Army, CII, FICCI and CAPSI . In principle, the task before this Council is to organize the Private sector through various initiatives aimed at developing the knowledge and skills and thereby to fulfill the aspiration of all stake holders.

Need for innovation inmotivating the Security personnel

It is believed that security personnel are the eyes and ears of management and they are bottom most layers in Pyramid of Management in business environment. All most all business establishments rely on security force 24x7 to secure the business from foreseeable threat both internal and external and physical in nature. Therefore it may not be incorrect to state that the unmotivated or poorly motivated workforce will cause harm to business slowly but definitely. Security to the business establishment is intertwined with several concerns, issues and challenges of other departments also on daily basis. In order to face them, top management needs a dedicated, trusted and independent security set up like a stand alone function yet interconnected with other wings of business. It certainly calls for disciplined and obedient workforce to comply with

basic systems and procedures established for larger interest of organization. As an accepted management concept, motivated workers can produce the result in an efficient and desire manner. This is possible only through proper and innovative Motivational schemes to different levels of security personnel deployed in business locations. Data available with security Industry association/ bodies clearly indicate that attrition rate is nearly 30 % annually in security department. To bring down the attrition rate a clear motivational strategy is required and more so, consistently ever on going basis.

Motivated security personnel can alter and address the incidents such as thefts, pilferage, sabotage, threat, industrial accidents occurring in business locations by careful investigation process. Under such circumstances, top management truly relies on the security contribution and this happens if and only when the security has the highly motivated workforce.

Benefits derived from motivating the security personnel:

The researcher has held formal and informal interaction with security personnel and end users holding different responsibilities across different industries. The insights gained from these interaction have been carefully studied and following scenarios can emerge as benefits to the various stake holders in the business settings.

Benefits to the company and management

1. Better output from the performance.
2. Out put from the action is consistent.
3. Emotional attachment or sense of family bonding with organisations.
4. Incidents of thefts, pilferagesetc most likely to be prevented in the organisations.

through the intervention of proper systematic

process.

5. Loss prevention methods and techniques are duly implemented.

Benefits to workforce

1. A clear understanding of the function of the job while motivating in selection process.
2. Morale of the security personnel increases and remains positive.
3. Better knowledge leads to faster job satisfaction
4. Performance deficiency is quickly addressed.
5. Career growth.
6. Advancement in remuneration is quicker rather wait for a period.
7. Emotional stability to withstand the occupational hazards
8. Motivated worker carries less work related issues to home
9. Team work, healthy performance and positive attitude emerge from the motivating atmosphere.
10. Recognition, Rewards and appreciation of work are the direct results to the motivated personnel.

Innovative Methods to motivate the security personnel

It is a simple common sense that motivation is a method to influence the mind to act in a particular way for which the motivation is intended to accomplish. Therefore influence of mind is a psychological process which itself is complex and different from individual to individual. There is no universally applicable motivational technique to influence the human behavior. Given the set of factors, if the influence is positive the resultant outcome is positive. These factors are categorized as Financial and Non financial or combination of both, the outcome of which determines the action of individuals. This is generally proven to be

correct as the majority of us are driven by both these factors with set of assumptions. First and the foremost assumption is the work or job is to be rewarded with measurable value. Universally easily measurable value with uniformity is money in most of daily situations. Therefore some of the financial forms of motivation are listed below:

Financial forms of innovative motivation tools

1) Festival advanced and or bonus
2) Salary revision based on a. tenure of service b. experience. C. position d. performance
e. Educational qualification.
3) Reimbursement of tuition fees to security personnel whose children are pursuing college with certain terms and conditions.
4) Educational scholarship to the outstanding children of security personnel in schools/college.
5) Rotation based weekly paid off
6) Marriage gifts to self or to the wards of the employees.
7) Medical reimbursement
8) Service awards for various length of service put up by security personnel

Non financial forms of Motivation:

1. Proper and theoretical orientation about the security function, duties and responsibilities is the first step in motivating them so that they are clearly aware of the scope of the security performance expected of them. They are not caught unaware between the expectation and actions during the course of the job. Management must ensure that this foundation programmeis to be followed by further periodical training of personnel.
2. Due recognition of the performance so that intrinsically it serves as a morale booster.
3. Open and timely appreciation of consistent performance highlighting the commitment and

efficiency of the work force.

4. Inviting and honoring the family members of selected security personnel on important celebrations and or day of the organization. E.g Founders day or Annual Day or Monthly or weekly outstanding performers day.

5. A space for security in the monthly or quarterly in house journal or magazine containing some important or critical role played in the line of duties

6. Out of turn promotion for the key role performed during the challenging and difficult times of the organization.

7. A reward certificate /plaque in recognition of the performance of the security personnel

Findings of the study

First and the foremost, in any business settings whether it is big or small and medium seized organisations the HR and Administration are responsible for total security operations i.e 24x7. It is found that they themselves do not have proper grounding in security knowledge. They appear to be knowledgeable and in reality majority of them are not so. They may have vague security knowledge in general by seeing the security workforce in different locations. Therefore the innovative motivation tools are yet to gain the attention of most of these managers.

There is always a demand and supply gap of employees in security department in almost all these organisations which is a challenge by itself in order provide a minimum security cover to business locations.

There is a dearth of trained and motivated security personnel to take up the as "security" job in the organization. Innovation to recruit and motivate them remains as secondary or least priority.
A very few organization have their own security staff to manage the security functions. Motivation

through contemporary methods remain distant objectives.

The knowledge of the security workforce recruited from these agencies is nearly zero or very limited in the initial stage.

On recruiting the candidates for the security job in the company –through outsourced route—the Administration or HR manager realises that these candidates have taken up the job as a last resort in the job hunt in the job market.

About 60% of the candidates possess basis education qualification as 8th standard, about

Conclusions

First and the foremost task of HR department is to realise that this is not a regular and predefined management functions like accounts, production, marketing, sales, quality etc. It is a stand alone function wherein the security operations are critical but seemingly less important in routine business affairs. Therefore HR or Admn should know the basic operations of security department. More so when 90% of security duties are performed by human beings. Other support systems will contribute only when the manned guarding is atleast knowledgeable if not efficient.

As the security function, by nature, is physically demanding and exhausting HR should consider innovative welfare measures such as subsidized canteen or food arrangement at least in the morning shift.

Motivation of security starts from simple gestures and ways. For example salutation in the morning or evening should be reciprocated. Have regular monitoring and interaction as frequently as possible. Empathise with their issues and try to uncover the reality and make attempt to resolve

them. For instance water and rest room facilities.

Motivation to security should be on action and not merely by words through innovative method . Mere words do not stand for a long time.

Since attrition rate is more in the security service, HR department should make a consistent efforts to keep the buffer stock. This is the biggest bottle neck one faces in the company when it is outsourced.

Recommendations

To Industries or the end users:

Innovation is the order of the day in any business operations. It applies security also. Therefore the HR department should deploy innovative strategies in recruiting, retaining the talents and eliciting the sustained performance.

To Security Service Providers:

They should pay attention to aspects like fair wages, minimum welfare and social benefits when the security personnel are recruited and deployed in customers location as per the commitment in the work order. Utmost priority is to be given to training and motivating the workforce employed in the security organisations.

To Top Management:

In any Organisation the top management treats the security as eyes and ears. Thus when they are expected to play such a critical role, the top management gives a   clear SOP to security department to function, in order to protect the properties and lives with fair and just.

To Front line security force:

The actual tasks or works are performed by the front line force such as security guards, Security officers, security supervisors, field supervisors. The actual performance is delivered through knowledge attained by practice and strict adherence to mental and physical standards required in this field.

Limitations of the study

The study is restricted to Chennai and Suburban loctation and does not represent the other locations.

By nature the security service is almost necessity to all most all the industries spread across the city of Chennai etc. Thus making the micro choice of the willing respondents to participate in the discussion is difficiult given the spread of the locations they reside or work.

It is felt that the security related affairs is associated to sensitivity and confidentiality and therefore the information, that is shared with us, took a lot of persuasion and confidence.

The structured format or schedule is not adopted in this survey as almost all the respondents, bearing security personnel, prefer informal discussion.
5. Time is the natural constraint along with the distance in travelling to meet the respondent groups.

Scope for further research

As the study is limited to one component of security service personnel i.e. Motivation. There is an enormous scope to make scholastic study in other areas such Training, work life balance. Job satisfaction , social perspective of security personnel. As such this area is not getting the due attention of the research according to the review of literature from Indian perspective. The reports produced so far by the Indian Business forums

such FICCI, NSDC are by nature a comprehensive and it is general. The scholars in this field can conduct research in various dimensions in different locations and in different industries as many times the security functions will differ depending on the business factors.

Reference

Bhupinder Singh Bhullar, "Growing responsibilities of Private Security in India, Indian Journal of Research. Issue no 5/ISSN 2250-991 published in May 2015

Chalal. S.S. Lt General (Retd) An article Glance at profile Private Security Service   published in Security Knowledge Development council in SKDC report in 2015

Chalal. S.S. Lt General (Retd). An Article published in Security Knowledge Development council in SKDC report in 2015

Jeffrey Sheppard & Jesse Mintz, A report "UNDERTRAINED, UNDERPAID AND UNPREPARED: Security officers Report on deficient safety standards in Manhattan Buildings, U.S.A. February 2005

Mark Button, Assessing the Regulation of Private Security across Europe

Volume 4 (1): 109–128: 1477-3708 DOI: 10.1177/1477370807071733 European Society of Criminology and SAGE Publications London, www.sagepublications.com. 2007

Mahesh K. Nalla. Research work on Private security, Michigan State University, School of Criminology, Publication in 2005

Mary, Dr. "Importance of Security Officers & the Role They Play Today." *Work - Chron.com*, http://work.chron.com/importance-security-officers-role-play-today-15199.html. 25 July 2018.

Rahul K. Bhonsle, "Human Resources in Security Sector: An integrated Model for the 21st century" . Journal of Defence studies. Volume no 4 of October 2010

Sanjay UpadhayaDr., "Plight and predicament of Security Guards engaged by Private Security Agencies in India, V.V. Giri National Labour Institute, Delhi . Article in 2011

South . N, "Policing for Profit" Sage Publications ISBN 080-8039-8175 –pbk . British Library cataloguing in publication data in the year 1988

Stenning et al, "Examining the role of Police & private security" Sage publications 1983. Sage. pub.doi/10.1350/ijps Jan 2010

Tim Prenzler. "Reforming security industry training standards: an Australian case study in International Journal of Comparative and Applied Criminal Justice vol 41, No. 4, PP 323-334

2009 Thomas Jager, "Private Military security companies Chances and Pitfalls publication ISBN 978-3-531-90313-2 in 2007

Zimmer, Performance issues   of Women Private Security Guards in Prison UK-Essays. www.ukessays.com/essays/criminology

Report

National Skill Development Corporation --study about the "Labour market in Private security sector in India in 2015

National skill development Corporation & KPMG report about the Private Security Industry under title " Human Resources and Skill Requirements in the Private Security Service Sector Volume 19 (2013 – 2017 and 2017 – 2022)

FICCI & PWC Report . Indian Private Security Industry Preparing for the next leap Nov 2015 http.//ficci.in/spdocument/20673